

BOOK-REVIEW

Chinchore, Dr. Mangala R., *Vādanyāya: The Nyāya-Buddhist Controversy*. Delhi, Sri Satguru Publications, 1988, pp. xx+213, Rs. 150.00

To say that traditions of ideas develop dialectically would be merely to state the obvious. Free thinking societies — and ancient India provides an outstanding example — abhor mental blinkers and ideological straitjackets. Intellectual freedom necessarily leads to plurality of standpoints. No sooner than an alternate line of thinking comes into being, mutual interaction in the form of refutation counter-refutation, logical defence and readjustments also begin. This process is the first condition for all intellectual stimulation.

Hegel was perhaps the first to point this process out in the chequered history of Greek thought. Dialectical value of the Sophist movement came to be acknowledged in the course of this exercise. It was clearly demonstrated that as far as the historical process was concerned, there were no heroes and villains. Every actor on the stage makes significant contribution to the ongoing drama. In our own case, historical circumstances compelled the first generation modern writers on the subject to lay so much emphasis on 'unity' that 'diversity' almost became something to be treated like a bad dream! One consequently gathers little idea of the actual historical development from the better known accounts of Indian philosophy. Every sect and school is regarded as an autonomous unit with little or no interaction with other similar ideological capsules or cocoons.

The work under review deserves kudos for being one of the very few to break out of this stagnant pool of ahistoricity. If my memory serves me right, Stcherbatsky was the first scholar of note to call for an objective understanding of the dialectical process responsible for the remarkable advances logic made in ancient India. While himself dealing with one aspect of Buddhist logic, he wanted others to try and unravel the actual relationship which obtained between the Buddhists and the Naiyāyikas. This was no ordinary task since it required good grounding in both the traditions as well as a first-hand acquaintance with the sources. Dharmendra Nath Shastri took up the challenge in his remarkable *Critique of Indian Realism*, dedicated to three ṛṣis, Stcherbatsky one of them !

Dr. Chinchore has, perhaps advisedly, concentrated on a somewhat inadequately analysed—understood text of Dharmakīrti the *Vādanāyāya*. This enables her to communicate Dharmakīrti's flavour to the non-specialists better. And yet hers is not a merely expository endeavour. As she discloses, her intention is "to reinterpret the relevant text with a view to rediscovering the key problems discussed in it, to find out the general framework—conceptual and categorial—within which they are raised and to study their implications."

The authoress has carried out her task very methodically. She devotes the first three chapters to present what may be regarded, at least partly, as the *pūrvapakṣa*. The first chapter is largely introductory from the Buddhist standpoint while the next two deal with the Nyāya position on the *Nigrahasthānas* and *hetvābhāsas*. She shows good understanding of Gautama, Vātsyāyana and Uddyotakara and while dealing with them she cannot be accused of being biased against them. This must be regarded as positive merit in any research work. She has her sympathies with Dharmakīrti, as is amply borne out by the sixth chapter,

but does not allow this to colour her vision. The fourth chapter explicates Dharmakīrti's methodological framework while the fifth elucidates his refutation of the twenty two *Nigrahasthānas* admitted by the Naiyāyikas. The final chapter encapsulates the Nyāya rejoinder in the decades and centuries after Dharmakīrti.

The book deserves wide attention. Product of a painstakingly honest labour, it makes one optimistic about research activity in our universities. The only discordant note that needs being sounded is regarding the language and printing. It is our misfortune that one has to write in a alien language to be understood all over the country. All of us suffer because of this constraint, some more, some less. However, I am sure a good editor assisted by some conscientious proof-readers could have added to the charm of this book.

Buddhist Studies have come to stay as a distinct discipline. We have departments or special assistance programmes to promote Buddhist Studies in several universities. The authoress would be well-advised to have the work translated in Indian languages.

Philosophy Department

Dr. Harisingh Gaur Vishvavidyalay

SAGAR-470 003 (M.P.)

PRATAP CHANDRA

INDIAN PHILOSOPHICAL QUARTERLY

Life Members (Individual)

263. Dr. Anjani Kumar Singh,
Param Jyot Nivas,
Alhadapur
GORAKHPUR 273 001. (U.P.)
264. Fr. Maria Arokiam Kanaga SDE
The Retreat,
Yercaud - 636 601
SALEM (T.N.)
265. Dr. Baliram Shukla,
Philosophy Department,
University of Poona,
PUNE 411 007.
266. Dr. N. G. Mahadevappa,
"Chaitanya"
Kalyan Nagar,
DHARWAD 580 007. (Karnatak)
267. Dr. (Mrs) Lata R. Chatre
Philosophy Department,
University of Poona,
PUNE 411 007.

BOOKS RECEIVED

- Bahadur, K. P.; *The Wisdom of Sāṃkhya*, Delhi, Sterling Publishers Pvt. Ltd., 1988 (Reprint), pp. 222; 125/- (HC)
- Bahadur, K. P.; *The Wisdom of Yoga : A Study of Patñjali's Yoga Sūtra*, Delhi, Sterling Publishers Pvt. Ltd., 1988 (Reprint), pp. 116; Rs. 100/- (HC)
- Bahadur, K. P.; *The Wisdom of Nyāya*; Delhi, Sterling Publishers Pvt. Ltd., 1988 (Reprint), pp xi + 246; Rs. 150/- (HC).
- Bandyopadhyaya, Tirthanath; *Man : An Essay in Philosophical Anthropology*, Calcutta, Papyrus; 1988; pp. 153; Rs. 100/- (HC).
- Banerjee, K. K.; *Language, Knowledge and Ontology*, Calcutta, Indian Council of Philosophical Research in association with Rddhi-India, 1988; pp. xxv + 374; Rs. 180/- (HC)
- Banerjee, N. V.; *Towards Perpetual Peace*, Delhi, Indian Institute of Advanced Study, Shimla in association with Motilal Banarsidas, 1988; pp. xii + 233; 120/- (HC)
- Pandit, M. P.; *Studies in the Tantras and the Veda*, Delhi, Sterling Publishers Pvt. Ltd., 1988; pp. 168; Rs. 100/- (HC)
- Sanyal, Ritwik; *Philosophy of Music*, Bombay, Somaiya Publications Pvt. Ltd., 1987; pp. xii + 228; Rs. 160/- (HC)

DARSHAN - MANJARI

The Burdwan University Journal of Philosophy

Editors :

Aminul Haque

Gopal Chandra Khan

Darshan-Manjari is a philosophical journal published annually by the Department of Philosophy, Burdwan University West Bengal. It seeks to promote discussion and research in all areas of philosophy, eastern and western. Three volumes of the journal have already been published. Now it invites papers for its next volumes scheduled to be published by March every year.

All contributions to the journal, books for review and other editorial enquiries should be sent to : The Editors, **Darshan-Manjari**, Department of Philosophy, Burdwan University, Burdwan-713 104, West Bengal.